Radiation Energy Budget Studies Using Collocated AVHRR and ERBE Observations

STEVEN A. ACKERMAN
Cooperative Institute of Meteorological Satellite Studies, Department of Atmospheric and Oceanic Sciences, University of Wisconsin—Madison, Madison, Wisconsin

TOSHIRO INOUE
Meteorological Research Institute, Ibaraki, Japan

(Manuscript received 29 May 1993, in final form 22 July 1993)

ABSTRACT

Changes in the energy balance at the top of the atmosphere are specified as a function of atmospheric and surface properties using observations from the Advanced Very High Resolution Radiometer (AVHRR) and the Earth Radiation Budget Experiment (ERBE) scanner. By collocating the observations from the two instruments, flown on NOAA-9, the authors take advantage of the remote-sensing capabilities of each instrument. The AVHRR spectral channels were selected based on regions that are strongly transparent to clear sky conditions and are therefore useful for characterizing both surface and cloud-top conditions. The ERBE instruments make broadband observations that are important for climate studies. The approach of collocating these observations in time and space is used to study the radiative energy budget of three geographic regions: oceanic, savanna, and desert.

1. Introduction

Climate feedback mechanisms are often observed as changes in the radiation energy budget of the earth—atmosphere system. To fully comprehend the coupling between climate change and perturbations in the earth radiation budget (ERB), we must address the physical relationships between changing atmospheric and surface conditions, and resultant changes in the ERB. This is best achieved through analysis of Earth Radiation Budget Experiment (ERBE) data in conjunction with coincident observations of atmospheric constituents (e.g., clouds, water vapor, and temperatures) obtained from other instruments. Full advantage of the capabilities of each instrument for monitoring climate parameters is attained by collocating the observations in time and space. For example, the ERBE scanning radiometers were designed to monitor the top-of-the-atmosphere energy budget. These instruments were not designed to derived cloud climatologies or surface properties. The Advanced Very High Resolution Radiometer (AVHRR) is better suited for defining the surface characteristics and identifying clouds. There have been several recent studies that combined monthly mean ERBE observations with monthly means from independent sources (e.g., Raval and Ramathan 1989; Stephens and Greenwald 1991). While such studies are extremely instructive, they do not improve on the inherent weakness of the individual instantaneous instrument measurement. Collocation of individual fields of view of the AVHRR and ERBE instruments was used by Li and Leighton (1991) to study the sensitivity of cloud radiative forcing in the Arctic to errors in scene identification resulting from using the ERBE instrument alone. Ackerman et al. (1992) used collocated AVHRR, High-Resolution Infrared Sounder (HIRS/2) and ERBE observations to study physical processes associated with the radiative energy budget at the top of the atmosphere. Baum et al. (1992) used collocated AVHRR and HIRS/2 observations to derive cloud optical properties.

The present study combines AVHRR and ERBE observations to investigate the sensitivity of fluxes at the top of the atmosphere to changing atmospheric and surface properties. By collocating these observations, cloud radiative forcing over a tropical ocean is described as a function of cloud type—stratus, cumulonimbus, and cirrus. For clear-sky ocean conditions, the greenhouse parameter, the ratio of the outgoing longwave flux at the top of the atmosphere, and the blackbody flux from the surface are composited as a function of the split-window temperature difference, which is an index of the total water vapor amount in the atmospheric column. Over western Africa, changes
in the energy budget at the top of the atmosphere are
described with respect to changes in surface properties.

Section 2 describes the instruments and observations
used in the study, as well as the collocation procedure.
Section 3 presents the results, which are then sum-
morized in section 4.

2. Data analysis

This study utilizes AVHRR and ERBE observations
made from the NOAA-9 polar-orbiting satellite over
the tropical eastern Pacific (approximately 10°S–20°N,
100°–140°W) and for western Africa (approximately
0°–25°N, 10°W–15°E) for the year 1986, for approx-
imately 6 days per month. The NOAA-9 nominal
equator crossing times are 0900 and 2100 UTC.

The AVHRR makes measurements in five spectral
bandpasses: channel 1 (0.56–0.68 µm); channel 2
(0.725–1.1 µm); channel 3 (3.55–3.93 µm); channel
4 (10.3–11.3 µm); and channel 5 (11.5–12.5 µm).
These five channels are regions where atmospheric
gases have weak absorption; data are therefore ap-
propriate for studying surface properties, such as sea sur-
face temperature and vegetation indexes, and cloud-
top properties. Calibration of the AVHRR is discussed
by Weinreb et al. (1990). Inoue (1987) developed a
cloud-type classification based on the AVHRR ob-
served equivalent brightness temperature in channel 4
(11 µm) and the temperature difference between chan-
nels 4 and 5 (11–12 µm). On the basis of the two-
dimensional histogram of the 11-µm temperature and
11–12-µm temperature difference, cirrus, dense cirrus,
cumulonimbus, cumulus, and stratus clouds can be
classified over the ocean. This study uses this classi-
fication scheme—the split-window method—discussed
in more detail below.

ERBE observes the broadband energy budget at the
top of the atmosphere. The ERBE instrument package
includes a scanning radiometer to measure the broad-
band shortwave (SW) and longwave (LW) radiances.
The instrument, and its calibration, is discussed by
Kopja (1986). Barkstrom et al. (1989) and Smith et
al. (1986) described the method of inverting the in-
stantaneous scanner observations for the top-of-at-
mosphere fluxes. These inversion procedures depend
on scene identification to select appropriate spectral
filter function correction, and anisotropic models.
Wielicki and Green (1989) presented the ERBE
method of scene identification, while Dieckman and
Smith (1989) discussed errors in outgoing fluxes asso-
ciated with scene misidentification.

To collocate the AVHRR pixels within the ERBE
footprint requires knowledge of the scanning geometry
of both instruments. The AVHRR scans by means of
a mirror that makes a full revolution in 1/6 s and has
a cross-track scan angle of ±55.4°, resulting in 2048
scenes in a scan line. The mirror step angle is approx-
imately 0.0541°. The AVHRR instrument has a nomi-
nal spatial resolution of 1.1 km at nadir. The AVHRR
data available in this study is global area coverage
(GAC) data, derived by averaging four out of five pixel
elements of every third line. The nominal resolution
of GAC data is considered to be 4 km at nadir.

The ERBE instrument samples at a rate of 0.033 s
while scanning the earth at a scan rate of 66.7° s⁻¹.
The ERBE field of view (FOV) is approximately 35 km. Because of the
large ERBE FOV overlap, approximately 35% at nadir,
AVHRR pixels are collocated within every other ERBE
line and element. The cross-track scan angle is adjust-
able to allow along-track scanning for developing an-
gular correction models; this paper considers the cross-
track scan mode only. Given the scanning geometry
of each instrument, the AVHRR pixels are collocated
within the ERBE footprint following the algorithm
outlined by Aoki (1980) for collocating AVHRR pixels
within the HIRS/2 footprints. This geometric solution
to collocation can be considered a close approximation;
however, it may not be exact due to errors in the sat-
ellite position, curvature of the earth, and any changes
in mirror angle and scan rate that occur while the sat-
etile is in space. In addition, the ERBE pixel location
latitude and longitude are defined at the top of the
atmosphere (30 km) while the AVHRR pixel em-
phemesis data are defined at the surface. Such errors
are not thought of as affecting the relative position
of the AVHRR imaged data with respect to an
image of the ERBE data. To account for this, the
AVHRR pixels are shifted along the track of the satellite
and/or along the scan direction to minimize

\[
\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} [\tilde{R}(l) - R(l)]^2,
\]

where \(N\) is the number of collocated ERBE fields of
view, \(R(l)\) is the ERBE measurement, and \(\tilde{R}(l)\) is
the mean AVHRR radiance. Best correlations occurred
with shifts of 1 lines and 2 elements of the AVHRR
image. Figure 1 is an example of this correlation for a
single geographic region. The linear correlation coef-
ficient between the ERBE and AVHRR measurements,
for this particular scene, is greater than 0.98 for both
the solar and infrared comparisons. This correlation
(which is typically greater than 0.85) is often less than
that of collocated AVHRR and HIRS/2 pixels (Ack-
erman et al. 1992; typically greater than 0.95) due to
the different spectral bandpasses of the AVHRR and
ERBE instruments.

3. Results

Results are presented for three geographic regions;
oceanic, savanna, and desert. These three geographic
regions were selected because of the varying degrees to which the atmosphere and surface are coupled together. The radiative energy budget at the surface is coupled to the atmosphere for all surfaces, as the composition and temperature structure of the atmosphere determine the incoming fluxes at the surface. At the top of the atmosphere (TOA) the upwelling radiation may be decoupled from the surface fluxes due to the intervening atmosphere.

The atmosphere and surface are coupled over the ocean regions—atmospheric water vapor content is a function of the surface temperature (Stephens 1990). We therefore expect good correlations between clear-sky TOA fluxes and surface properties (e.g., sea surface temperature). An ocean region was also selected because the surface is uniform in temperature and albedo, particularly when compared to land, thus enabling us to use these combined observations to study the radiative impact of different cloud types.

The Sahel region chosen as feedback between the land surface and atmosphere may be a self-reinforcing mechanism of droughts (Charney 1975) in this region. Satellite observations provide a useful tool for monitoring the seasonal and annual weather of geographic regions where rains are highly variable, in both time and space, and the surface properties change markedly with precipitation, as in the Sahel. A disadvantage of satellite analysis is that satellites provide only “snapshots” of the present conditions and not physical links between mechanisms. Investigation of this link between the surface properties and the TOA energy budget is accomplished using the combined observations.

The final geographic locale considered was a desert region, the Sahara. With very little if any vegetation, the desert may at first seem a simple geographic region for developing energy budget parameterizations. The atmosphere is coupled to the surface via strong sensible heat fluxes, which can result in mixed-layer depths of 5 km in summer. We might therefore expect a coupling between the surface and the TOA fluxes. On the other hand, advection of atmospheric water vapor and dust storms tends to decouple the energy budget at the top of the atmosphere from the surface physical properties. The collocated observations demonstrate the complex nature of deserts.

a. Oceanic clear-sky results

The effect of water vapor on the planetary radiative energy budget over oceans has recently been described using satellite observations by Raval and Ramanathan (1989), Stephens and Greenwald (1991), and Ackerman et al. (1992). The greenhouse effect of water vapor is quantified based on the greenhouse parameter

$$G = \frac{T_s^4}{T_s^4},$$

where $T_s$ is the sea surface temperature and $T_s$ is the effective clear-sky planetary temperature determined from the ERBE-measured outgoing longwave radiation ($OLR = \sigma T_s^4$). While ERBE incorporates a scene identification algorithm, the present study determines clear-sky scenes based on the split-window technique (Inoue 1987), in conjunction with the uniformity of the AVHRR brightness temperature within the ERBE footprint. Specifically, a clear-sky ocean scene is defined if the 11-µm brightness temperature (BT$_{11}$) is greater than 280 K, the BT difference between 11 and 12 µm ($\Delta BT_{11-12}$) is $0 < \Delta BT_{11-12} < 3$, and the standard deviation of the BT$_{11}$ within the ERBE footprint is less than 0.1 K. This last condition is referred to as the scene uniformity and is calculated using radiance observations. Under clear sky conditions, sea surface temperatures are derived from AVHRR observations.
using the NOAA (National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration) operational method described by McClain (1989).

Previous studies (e.g., Raval and Ramanathan 1989; Stephens and Greenwald 1991; Ackerman et al. 1992) have demonstrated a dependence of the greenhouse parameter on sea surface temperature. This relationship is driven by the coupling between sea surface temperature and precipitable water; a relationship recently discussed by Stephens (1990). The $\Delta BT_{11-12}$ is an indication of the atmospheric water vapor structure in the lower atmosphere, which makes a large contribution to the total precipitable water. The relationship derived in the present study is shown in Fig. 2 as a box–whisker diagram. This figure was generated by compositing the observed $G$ over a 0.25° interval of $\Delta BT_{11-12}$ for the entire dataset. The solid box represents the mean over the interval, the open rectangle the standard error, and the vertical lines the standard deviation. The open circles labeled outliers are observations that fell below or above the mean by more than two standard deviations. This figure demonstrates the relationship between the greenhouse parameter and $\Delta BT_{11-12}$, showing a dependence between the greenhouse parameter and $\Delta BT_{11-12}$ between $1^\circ$ and $2^\circ$. Stephens and Greenwald (1991) demonstrated the dependence of $G$ on total precipitable water. As the split-window difference is related to the total precipitable water, Fig. 2 is in agreement with the previous studies. A linear fit of $G$ with the split window explains 60% of the variance and has a correlation coefficient of 0.77. The variability about the linear relationship is due likely to variations in the upper-tropospheric water vapor (Ackerman et al. 1992; Stephens and Greenwald 1991). The relationship between $G$ and $\Delta BT_{11-12}$ for $1^\circ > \Delta BT_{11-12}$ for $1^\circ > \Delta BT_{11-12} > 2^\circ$ is difficult to state due to the small sample, as indicated in the frequency-of-occurrence diagram shown in Fig. 3. This histogram also indicates a seasonal variation in temperature differences associated with the seasonal variation in precipitable water.

b. Oceanic cloudy-sky results

The radiative properties of clouds are described in terms of cloud radiative forcing defined as the difference between the observed flux and the clear-sky flux: for the longwave,

$$LWCF = OLR_{clr} - OLR_{cld},$$

where OLR is the outgoing longwave radiation and the subscripts $clr$ and $cld$ represent clear and cloudy conditions; for the shortwave,

$$SWCF = S_0(\alpha_{clr} - \alpha_{cld}),$$

where $S_0$ is the incoming solar radiation and $\alpha$ is the observed albedo. Ramanathan et al. (1989) and Harrison et al. (1990) derived the global distribution of cloud forcing based on ERBE observations on a spatial scale of $2.5^\circ \times 2.5^\circ$ and monthly averages. Ackerman et al. (1992) combined ERBE, AVHRR, and HIRS/2 observations to describe cloud forcing as a function of cloud amount and altitude. Due to the similar size in the ERBE and HIRS/2 fields of view, Ackerman et al. (1992) described these relations on a spatial scale of $3 \times 3$ ERBE footprints. The advantage of this study is

![AVHRR Chan. 4 – Chan. 5](image)

Fig. 3. Histogram of the split-window difference (K) as a function of season for a region in the eastern Pacific.
the higher spatial resolution, the use of individual 
ERBE footprints, and a classification of cloud type. Li 
and Leighton (1991) combined AVHRR and ERBE 
observations to study cloud radiative forcing in the 
Arctic. The current study uses a different collocation 
procedure and different scene identification approach 
and addresses the tropical regions.

The split-window technique developed by Inoue 
(1987, 1989) is based on a threshold technique applied 
to a two-dimensional histogram of the brightness tem-
temperature of the 11-μm channel and the brightness tem-
temperature difference between the split-window ob-
servations. In this study the ∆BT threshold for low-level 
clouds is ∆BT < 1.0°; the BT11 is between 250 and 
294 K. Cumulonimbus clouds are identified when the 
BT11 is less than 250 and the ∆BT is less than 1.5° 
and greater than −2°. The final category is cirrus, in 
which the BT11 is less than 294° and the ∆BT ranges 
between 3° and 9°.

Radiative cloud forcing is shown in Fig. 4, compos-
ited as a function of season. Clear-sky values were de-
termined for each month as discussed above. The three 
cloud classifications are stratus, cirrus, and cumulo-
nimbus. The cumulonimbi display the largest SWCF 
and LWCF. Notice that stratus clouds and thin cirrus 
clouds can have the same effect on modifying the clear-

Fig. 4. The longwave and shortwave cloud forcing (W m−2) as a function of season for different cloud classifications: circles—stratus; stars—cirrus; boxes—cumulonimbus.
sky OLR; however, the stratus has a larger effect on the shortwave because the water contents of stratus are generally larger than the ice content of cirrus. These types of relationships are difficult to derive directly with ERBE observations alone. A similar relationship between the LWCF and SWCF with respect to cloud type exists for each of the seasons. The analysis as a function of season clearly indicates an annual variation in cloud type. Cumulonimbus clouds were generally not observed in the summer and winter seasons and were at a maximum in the spring. Low-level clouds are observed throughout the year as would be expected over the oceans. Thus, seasonal changes in cloud forcing for this region are likely due to changes in cloud-type distribution.

c. Semidesert clear-sky results

The previous sections combined the two observations to investigate the relationship between outgoing longwave radiation at the TOA and the brightness temperature difference between spectral observations at 11 and 12 μm. This relationship comes about because of the dependence of the observations on atmospheric water vapor content, which is strongly tied to sea surface temperature. The next step is to investigate relationships between TOA radiative fluxes and surface characteristics over land. An important component of the ERBE program has been its observation of cloud forcing, which is regionally dependent (Harrison et al. 1990). Changes in cloud forcing can result from changes in cloud amount or type, atmospheric condition, or surface properties. The effect of changing cloud type over oceans was demonstrated in the previous section. To understand cloud forcing over land we need to address coupling between the surface and the TOA energy budget. A classic example of this coupling is the desertification proposed by Charney (1975). This section is a first attempt at addressing these issues from combined AVHRR and ERBE satellite observations.

As in the previous section, the AVHRR pixels are collocated within the ERBE footprint. Shortwave and longwave fluxes at the TOA are specified from the ERBE observations. Surface vegetation characteristics and temperature are estimated using the AVHRR observations. The surface properties are expressed in terms of the normalized difference vegetation index (NDVI), derived from the AVHRR channel 1 and channel 2 observations (Tucker et al. 1984):

\[
\text{NDVI} = \frac{\text{Chan 2} - \text{Chan 1}}{\text{Chan 2} + \text{Chan 1}}.
\]

The NDVI is a function of greenness and amount of vegetation with the higher values associated with greener scenes (Tucker et al. 1984; Justice et al. 1985; Townshend and Justice 1986; Tucker et al. 1986). In addition, the AVHRR data are used to determine the cloud- and dust-free regions as well as the scene homogeneity within the ERBE footprint. Dust storms are indicated by negative brightness temperature differences between the 11- and 12-μm channels (Ackerman and Chung 1992). Results are presented for 6 days in October 1986 for the Sahel region.

The box-whisker diagram (Fig. 5) is used to depict the relationship between surface NDVI and TOA fluxes for the Sahel region between 5° and 15°N. Points different from the mean by more than ±2 standard deviations are plotted as outliers. The vegetation of this semiarid region is primarily grasses. As the surface NDVI decreases, due to either less vegetation or drying vegetation, the albedo increases (Fig. 5a). A second-order polynomial fit of the albedo versus the NDVI explains 66% of the variance \( r \) with a correlation \( r = 0.82 \). The OLR (Fig. 5b) also displays a tendency to increase as the NDVI decreases (\( r = 54\% \), \( r = 0.73 \)). Some of the variability depicted in Fig. 5 results from atmospheric variability, as well as instrument characteristics. For clear sky conditions, the ERBE-measured longwave flux is more sensitive to the state of the atmosphere than the albedo and NDVI, which accounts for the smaller correlation with NDVI. The coupling of the albedo and OLR to surface characteristics, as indicated by their respective relationships with NDVI, results in the relationship depicted in Fig. 6 (\( r = 0.61 \)). For this region of western Africa, when the albedo increases, the LW flux at the TOA correspondingly increases, in agreement with the desertification mechanism of Charney.

![Box-whisker diagram of AVHRR NDVI versus ERBE albedo (%) for the Sahel region.](image)
d. Desert clear-sky results

We now address the relationships for a geographic region denude of vegetation at 15°–25°N. The NDVIs for soil range between 0.2 and 0.3. As the NDVI is not related to soil type, there is no relationship between NDVI and the TOA fluxes for this region. One might expect a relationship between the albedo and OLR, such that as the surface gets darker, the albedo gets lower, with the OLR increasing due to an increased surface temperature. Analysis of the ERBE-measured albedo and OLR is depicted in Fig. 7, suggesting little correlation \( r = 0.15 \). This spectral decoupling may result from different spectral characteristics of the atmosphere, which are more transparent to the SW than the LW. The OLR and broadband albedo are correlated with the AVHRR 11-μm brightness temperature and channel 1 reflectance, respectively, indicating the importance of the surface in determining the magnitude of TOA fluxes. An analysis of the AVHRR 11-μm brightness temperature and AVHRR visible reflectance (Fig. 8) is similar to broadband results in that no correlations are apparent. Thus, the variance between TOA broadband fluxes (Fig. 7) is not due solely to atmospheric variability; surface characteristics also play

\[ \text{ERBE LW Flux (W/m}^2\text{)} \]

\[ \text{ERBE Albedo (\%)} \]

\[ \text{AVHRR Channel 4 Brightness Temperature} \]

\[ \text{AVHRR Channel 1 Reflectance (\%)} \]
an important role. For example, different soil types with the same albedo may have different specific heats—for the same amount of absorbed solar energy, one soil may raise its temperature faster than another, thereby decoupling the SW properties from the LW.

The present analysis indicates that the TOA fluxes are not decoupled from the surface properties; rather, it appears that for the region as a whole, the TOA fluxes and surface properties are decoupled spectrally. It may also be that the signal we are seeking is weak and therefore requires suitable time and space averaging to become apparent. Observations (e.g., Smith 1986) have demonstrated that the mean properties of the desert surface are controlled by radiative exchanges at the surface. What this study suggests is that parameterizations derived for one geographic region may not be easily extended to another desert region.

4. Summary

An approach to studying the radiative energy budget of the planet using collocated AVHRR and ERBE observations is presented. By collocating the observations from the two instruments flown on the NOAA-9 and NOAA-10 satellites one is able to take advantage of the remote-sensing capabilities of each instrument. The AVHRR spectral channels were selected based on regions that are weakly absorbing and are therefore useful for characterizing surface and cloud-top conditions. The ERBE instruments make broadband observations that are important for climate studies. By combining the observations, we address how changing surface and cloud conditions affect the energy budget at the top of the atmosphere. The disadvantage of the technique is that observed relationships between the surface and cloud properties and TOA fluxes are inherently noisy. The analysis therefore requires many collocated observations or appropriate statistical representation of the data.

The results can be summarized as the following:

- The greenhouse parameter is well correlated with the split-window brightness temperature difference of the AVHRR (a linear fit of $G$ with $\Delta BT_{11-12}$ explains 60% of the variance with a correlation coefficient of 0.77). For clear sky conditions, the split-window difference is an indication of the water vapor loading, and the results are therefore consistent with previous studies.

- The collocated observations were used to derive cloud radiative forcing as a function of three cloud types—cumulonimbus, stratus, and cirrus. Cloud types classified by the split-window technique show reasonable relationships with the TOA fluxes observed by ERBE. Of the three cloud types, cumulonimbus have the largest effect in modifying the clear-sky SW and LW fluxes. Stratus clouds have a larger SW cloud forcing than cirrus, although LW cloud forcing for the two cloud types show similar values. While no surprises were found in the analysis, the approach can be extended to analyze the effect of cloud microphysical properties, as derived from the AVHRR observations, on the top-of-the-atmosphere energy budget as measured by ERBE.

- There appears to be a good correlation between vegetation cover, in terms of the AVHRR NDVI product, and ERBE top-of-the-atmosphere fluxes for the Sahel region. A second-order polynomial fit to the ERBE albedo and AVHRR NDVI observations explains 66% of the variance with a correlation coefficient of 0.87. A similar least-squares fit to the AVHRR NDVI and collocated ERBE LW flux yields a correlation of 0.73, which explains 54% of the variance. The weaker correlation between ERBE LW flux and NDVI is attributed to atmospheric variability. The observed relationship supports the land–atmosphere feedback mechanism whereby land surface changes can induce changes in the radiative energy balance that could support further changes at the surface. The observed relationships may be useful in verifying land surface feedback mechanisms of general circulation models.

- No apparent relationship between the SW and LW fluxes exists in the interior Sahara desert indicating, from an energy balance perspective, the complex nature of deserts. The analysis suggests that radiative parameterizations derived for one desert region may not be easily extended to another desert region due to differences in soil characteristics.

Acknowledgments. This work was supported by NASA under Grant NAS1-18272. We are indebted to the programming efforts of Richard A. Frey.

REFERENCES


